ORIGINAL

0000063384

BEFORE THE ARIZONA CORPORATION CO. 1 RECEIVED **COMMISSIONERS** 2 3 JEFF HATCH-MILLER, Chairman 7006 NOV -7 1 P 4: 07 WILLIAM A. MUNDELL MIKE GLEASON AZ CORP COMMISSION KRISTIN K. MAYES DOCUMENT CONTROL 5 **BARRY WONG** IN THE MATTER OF THE APPLICATION OF DOCKET NO. E-01345A-05-0816 ARIZONA PUBLIC SERVICE COMPANY FOR A HEARING TO DETERMINE THE FAIR VALUE OF THE UTILITY PROPERTY OF THE COMPANY FOR RATEMAKING PURPOSES, TO FIX A JUST AND REASONABLE RATE OF RETURN THEREON, TO APPROVE RATE SCHEDULES DESIGNED TO DEVELOP SUCH 10 RETURN, AND TO AMEND DECISION NO. 67744. 11 IN THE MATTER OF THE INQUIRY INTO THE DOCKET NO. E-01345A-05-0826 FREOUENCY OF UNPLANNED OUTAGES 12 **DURING 2005 AT PALO VERDE NUCLEAR** GENERATING STATION, THE CAUSES OF THE 13 OUTAGES, THE PROCUREMENT OF 14 REPLACEMENT POWER AND THE IMPACT OF THE OUTAGES ON ARIZONA PUBLIC SERVICE COMPANY'S CUSTOMERS. 15 16 IN THE MATTER OF THE AUDIT OF THE FUEL DOCKET NO. E-01345A-05-0827 AND PURCHASED POWER PRACTICES AND 17 COSTS OF THE ARIZONA PUBLIC SERVICE COMPANY. 18 STAFF'S NOTICE OF FILING 19 Staff of the Arizona Corporation Commission hereby provides notice of filing the Testimony 20 Summary of David C. Parcell in the above-referenced matter. 21 22 RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 7th day of November, 2006. 23 24 Arizona Corporation Commission DOCKETED Christopher C. Kempley, Chief Counsel 25 Janet Wagner, Senior Staff Counsel Charles Hains, Attorney NOV -7 2006 26 Arizona Corporation Commission 1200 West Washington Street 27 DOCKETED BY Phoenix, Arizona 85007 (602) 542-3402 28

1 2	Original and 17 copies of the foregoing filed this 7 th day of November, 2006, with:	
2	Docket Control	
3	Arizona Corporation Commission	
	1200 West Washington	
4	Phoenix, AZ 85007	
_		
5		
6	Copy of the foregoing mailed this	
	7 th day of November, 2006 to:	
7	D1 1 D C #	25.1
8	Deborah R. Scott	Michael W. Patten
0	Kimberly A. Grouse	J. Matthew Derstine
9	SNELL & WILMER	Laura E. Sixkiller
	One Arizona Center	ROSHKA DEWULF & PATTEN, PLC
10	400 East Van Buren Street	One Arizona Center
	Phoenix, AZ 85004-2202	400 East Van Buren Street, Suite 800
11		Phoenix, AZ 85004
12	Thomas L. Mumaw	
12	Karilee S. Ramaley	Michael L. Kurtz
13	PINNACLE WEST CAPITAL	BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY
10,	CORPORATION	36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
14	Post Office Box 53999, MS 8695	Cincinnati, OH 45202
	Phoenix, AZ 85072-3999	
15		Scott S. Wakefield
1.0	C. Webb Crockett	RUCO
16	Patrick J. Black	1110 West Washington Street, Suite 220
17	FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C.	Phoenix, AZ 85007
1,	3003 North Central Avenue, Suite 2600	
18	Phoenix, AZ 85012-2913	Lawrence V. Robertson, Jr.
		Post Office Box 1448
19	Michelle Livengood	Tubac, AZ 85646
20	UniSource Energy Services	
20	One South Church Street, Suite 200	Bill Murphy
21	Tucson, AZ 85702	Murphy Consulting
21		5401 North 25 th Street
22	Donna M. Bronski	Phoenix, AZ 85016
	Deputy City Attorney	
23	City Attorney's Office	Andrew W. Bettwy
0.4	3939 North Drinkwater Boulevard	Karen S. Haller
24	Scottsdale, AZ 85251	Assistants General Cunsel
25		Legal Affairs Department
<i>ر</i> ب	George Bien-Willner	5241 Spring Mountain Road
26	3641 North 39 th Avenue	Las Vegas, NV 89150
	Phoenix, AZ 85014	
27		

	Amanda Ormond	Dan Austin
1	The Ormond Group LLC	Comverge, Inc.
2	Southwest Representative	6509 West Frye Road, Suite 4
2	Interwest Energy Alliance	Chandler, AZ 85226
3	7650 South McClintock, Suite 103-282	
	Tempe, AZ 85284	Timothy M. Hogan
4		Arizona Center for Law in the Public Interest
_	Joseph Knauer, President	202 East McDowell Road, Suite 153
5	Jewish Community of Sedona	Phoenix, AZ 85004
6	and the Verde Valley	
	100 Meadowlark Drive	Jay I. Moyes
7	Post Office Box 10242	Moyes Storey Ltd.
	Sedona, AZ 86339-8242	1850 North Central Avenue, Suite 110
8		Phoenix, AZ 85004
9	David C. Kennedy, Esq.	
	818 East Osborn Road, Suite 103	Kenneth R. Saline, P.E.
10	Phoenix, AZ 85014	K.R. Saline & Assoc., PLC
		160 North Pasadena, Suite 101
11	S. David Childers, Esq.	Mesa, AZ 85201
12	LOW & CHILDERS	Dalas W. Casles
12	2999 North 44 th Street, Suite 250	Robert W. Geake
13	Phoenix, AZ 85018	Vice President and General Counsel
	Tanasa Canana	Arizona Water Company Post Office Box 29006
14	Tracy Spoon	
1.5	Sun City Taxpayers Association 12630 North 103 rd Avenue, Suite 144	Phoenix, AZ 85038-9006
15	Sun City, AZ 85351	Lieutenant Colonel Karen S. White
16	Sull City, AZ 65551	Chief, Air Force Utility Litigation Team
	Tammie Woody	AFLSA/JACL-ULT
17	10825 West Laurie Lane	139 Barnes Drive
	Peoria, AZ 85345	Tyndall AFB, FL 32403
18	1 cona, AZ 65545	1 yildan 1 11 52 +05
19	Douglas V. Fant	Greg Patterson
	Law Offices of Douglas V. Fant	Arizona Competitive Power Alliance
20	3655 West Anthem Drive, Suite A-109	916 West Adams Street, Suite 3
	Anthem, AZ 85086	Phoenix, AZ 85007
21		
22	Walter W. Meek, President	Jim Nelson
22	Arizona Utility Investors Association	12621 North 17 th Place
23	2100 North Central Avenue, Suite 210	Phoenix, AZ 85022
	Phoenix, AZ 85004	
24		Barbara Klemstine
25	Sein Seitz, President	Brian Brumfield
23	Arizona Solar Energy Industries Association	Arizona Public Service
26	3008 North Civic Center Plaza	Post Office Box 53999, MS 9708
	Scottsdale, AZ 85251	Phoenix, AZ 85072-3999
27		

1	Jon Poston AARP Electric Rate Project 6733 East Dale Lane Cave Creek, AZ 85331		
2			
3			
4			
	Coralette Hannon AARP Government Relations & Advocacy		
5	6705 Reedy Creek Road Charlotte, NC 28215		
6	Charlotte, IVC 20213		
7			
8	monica a martine		
9			
10			
11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
17			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY OF TESTIMONY OF DAVID C. PARCELL

RECOMMENDATIONS AND SUMMARY

RECOMMENDATIONS

My overall cost of capital recommendation for APS is as follows:

	<u>Percent</u>	Cost	Return
Long-Term Debt	45.5%	5.41%	2.46%
Common Equity	<u>54.5%</u>	10.25%	2.59%
Total	100.00%		8.05%

APS's application requests a return on equity of 11.5 percent and a total cost of capital of 8.73%.

On November 2, 1006, I filed updates to Schedules 2, 8, 9, 10, page 1 of 11, and 13 to my Direct Testimony. These updates do not change my recommendations.

ANALYSES AND CONCLUSIONS

This proceeding is concerned with APS's regulated electric utility operations in Arizona. My analyses are concerned with APS's total cost of capital. The first step in performing these analyses is the development of the appropriate capital structure. APS's proposed capital structure is its adjusted September 30, 2005 capital structure ratios of 45.5 percent long-term debt and 54.5 percent common equity. I have adopted these capital structure ratios in my cost of capital analyses.

The second step in a cost of capital calculation is a determination of the embedded cost rate of long-term debt. I have used the 5.41 percent cost of long-term debt proposed by APS.

The third step in the cost of capital calculation is the estimation of the cost of common equity. I have employed three recognized methodologies to estimate the cost of equity for APS. I applied

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY OF TESTIMONY OF DAVID C. PARCELL

each of these methodologies to two proxy groups: 1) a group of comparison electric utilities with similar operating and risk characteristics to APS and PWC; and 2) and the group of proxy electric companies analyzed by Company witness Avera. These three methodologies and my findings are:

<u>Methodology</u>	Range	
Discounted Cash Flow	9 1/2-10%	
Capital Asset Pricing Model	10 1/2-10 3/4%	
Comparable Earnings	10%	

Based upon these findings, I conclude that the cost of common equity for APS is a range of 9 1/2 percent to 10 3/4 percent, with an approximate mid-point of 10.25 percent. I recommend a cost of equity for APS of 10.25 percent.

Combining these three steps into weighted costs of capital results in an overall rate of return of 8.05 percent.